

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

---

IN RE: TERRORIST ATTACKS ON  
SEPTEMBER 11, 2001

---

:  
:  
: Civil Action No.  
: 03 MDL 1570 (GBD) (SN)  
:  
:

This Document Relates to:

*Grazioso, et al. v. Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan aka the Taliban, et al.*,  
1:22-cv-01188 (GBD)(SN)

**[Proposed] ORDER GRANTING THE *GRAZIOSO* PLAINTIFFS PARTIAL FINAL  
DEFAULT JUDGMENT AGAINST DEFENDANT THE TALIBAN**

GEORGE B. DANIELS, United States District Judge:

**WHEREAS**, this Court previously, on December 22, 2011, entered an Order of Judgment as to liability against Defendant the Islamic Emirate Taliban aka the Taliban in the case of *Havlish, et al. v. bin Laden, et al.*, 1:03-md-1570 (GBD)(SN); 1:03-cv-09848 (GBD)(SN) at MDL ECF No. 2516;

**WHEREAS**, this Court previously, on October 12, 2012, issued a final Order and Judgment as to damages against Defendant the Taliban in the case of *Havlish, et al. v. bin Laden, et al.*, 1:03-md-1570 (GBD)(SN); 1:03-cv-09848 (GBD)(SN) at MDL ECF No. 2624;

**WHEREAS**, the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs filed suit against Defendant the Taliban on February 15, 2022, *Grazioso* Doc. No. 1;

**WHEREAS**, the operative pleading in this matter is the Second Amended Complaint filed on August 23, 2022 (*Grazioso* Doc. No. 29; MDL Doc. No. 8428);

**WHEREAS**, this Court, on April 17, 2023, issued an Opinion and Order authorizing the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs to use alternative service methods to serve their pleadings and related

materials on Defendant the Taliban pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 4(f)(3) (the “*Grazioso* Service Order”). *See Grazioso* Doc. No. 52; MDL Doc. No. 9024;

**WHEREAS**, pursuant to the *Grazioso* Service Order, *Grazioso* Plaintiffs’ counsel drafted a notice of this action in compliance with CPLR § 316 and had it translated into the Arabic language and into Pashto, the recognized official language of Afghanistan, and such notice was published for four consecutive weeks in the *Al-Quds Al-Arabi* newspaper, as well as the U.S. editions and international editions of *The New York Times*. *See* Certificate Of Service, dated August 2, 2023, at *Grazioso* Doc. No. 57; MDL Doc. No. 9258, ¶¶ 4,7-10;

**WHEREAS**, pursuant to the *Grazioso* Service Order and as stated in their published legal notices, *Grazioso* Plaintiffs’ counsel facilitated the creation of a publicly-accessible online website at [www.wigginschilds.com/grazioso](http://www.wigginschilds.com/grazioso) which contains the text of the legal notice in English, Arabic and Pashto, as well as the *Grazioso* Second Amended Complaint and Summons in English and Pashto, see *id.* ¶6;

**WHEREAS**, pursuant to the *Grazioso* Service Order, *Grazioso* Plaintiffs’ counsel further served the Defendant Taliban by sending notice in English, Arabic, and Pashto to known Taliban-related Twitter accounts through a counsel-created account for the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs with the handle “@Grazioso\_Plaintiffs” which sent messages in English and Pashto to the Twitter accounts of prominent Taliban leaders, as follows: Abdullah Azzam, the secretary to Taliban Acting First Deputy Prime Minister Abdul Ghani Baradar; Taliban political spokesman Mohammed Naeem; Abdul Qahar Balkhi, a spokesperson for the Taliban’s Ministry of Foreign Affairs; Qari Yousaf Ahmadi, a Taliban spokesperson; Suhail Shaheen, a Taliban spokesman; and Zabihullah Mujahid, a spokesperson for the Taliban, *see id.*, ¶¶11-21;

;

**WHEREAS**, although not required to do so by the *Grazioso* Service Order, Plaintiffs’ counsel sent three additional packages of the *Grazioso* Service Materials, with cover letters translated into Pashto, to three different representatives of Defendant the Taliban in Kabul, Afghanistan, via Federal Express International (“FedEx”) courier, which Federal Express was unable to track;

**WHEREAS**, although not required to do so by the *Grazioso* Service Order, *Grazioso* Plaintiffs’ counsel sent an additional package of the *Grazioso* Service Materials, with a cover letter translated into Pashto, via FedEx to the Embassy of Afghanistan in Doha, Qatar, delivery of which was refused by the recipient after having apparently opened the package, and said package was returned to sender;

**WHEREAS**, although not required to do so by the *Grazioso* Service Order, *Grazioso* Plaintiffs’ counsel sent an additional package of the *Grazioso* Service Materials, again with a cover letter translated into Pashto, via United States Postal Service (“USPS”) registered mail to the Embassy of Afghanistan in Doha, Qatar, delivered of which was never confirmed by USPS;

**WHEREAS**, based on the above facts, all of the relevant pleadings documents, including the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs’ Second Amended Complaint (*Grazioso* Doc. No. 29; MDL Doc. No. 8428), and Summons, dated August 23, 2021, (*Grazioso* Doc. No. 31; MDL Doc. No. 8424), and certified translations of each (the “*Grazioso* Service Materials”), were served on Defendant the Taliban in accordance with law, and in a manner reasonably calculated to provide the Taliban with notice of this proceeding and give them an opportunity to appear and defend;

**WHEREAS**, Defendant the Taliban has failed to enter an appearance in this Court and has not filed any responsive pleading to the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs’ Second Amended Complaint,

nor any other pleading filed by the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs, even though Defendant the Taliban has been afforded more than sixty (60) days to file responses;

**WHEREAS**, based on the above facts, a Certificate of Default was issued on November 8, 2023, by the Clerk of the Court, Southern District of New York, *see Grazioso* Doc. No. 62, MDL Doc. No. 9425;

**WHEREAS**, evidence as to liability and damages in this matter was submitted by Plaintiffs in filings with this Court on \_\_\_\_\_, 2025;

**WHEREAS**, an evidentiary hearing on liability was held on \_\_\_\_\_, 2025, at which evidence was presented, including the evidence previously submitted by Plaintiffs in *Havlish, et al. v. bin Laden, et al.*, 03-cv-09848 (GBD)(FM) on May 19, 2011, July 13, 2011, August 19, 2011, and December 15, 2011, *see* MDL Doc. Nos. 2430-2433, 2502, and 2474, and *Hoglan, et al v. Islamic Republic of Iran, et al.*, 1:11-cv-07550 (GBD)(SN), on August 17, 2015, *see* MDL Doc. No. 3027, along with additional evidence introduced by Plaintiffs, all of which was admitted into evidence by this Court;

**AND NOW**, upon consideration of the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs' Motion for Partial Final Judgment against the Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan *aka* the Taliban, any Exhibits attached thereto, the accompanying Memorandum of Law, the Declaration of Timothy B. Fleming, Esq., the Declaration of Andrew Levitt, and the entire record in this multidistrict litigation, **IT IS HEREBY**

**ORDERED** that judgment as to liability is entered in favor of the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs, with the lead Plaintiff being Deborah Grazioso, Personal Representative of the Estate of Timothy Grazioso, Deceased, and the surviving Spouse of Timothy Grazioso, Deceased, and against the Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan *aka* the Taliban under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. §2333,

which provides for trebling of compensatory damage amounts; and **IT IS FURTHER**

**ORDERED** that damages are entered in favor of the following Plaintiffs, the Estate of Joyce Ann Carpeneto, the Estate of Denease Conley, the Estate of Wayne T. Davis, the Estate of Francisco Garfi, the Estate of Timothy Grazioso, the Estate of LeRoy W. Homer, the Estate of Leon Lebor, the Estate of Rocco Medaglia, the Estate of Louis J. Nacke, the Estate of Sandra Wright-Cartledge, each of whom is a 9/11 Decedent for whom damages have been already determined in another case within this MDL, and against the Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan aka the Taliban as follows, and as reflected on the submitted Standard Exhibits accompanying the Motion:

a) Compensatory damages for pain and suffering (non-economic loss) in the amount of \$2,000,000 each, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333, for a total of \$6,000,000 each;

b) Economic Loss damages totaling, for the ten *Grazioso* 9/11 Decedent Estate Plaintiffs whose damages have been determined previously in another case within this MDL as set forth in **Exhibit A**, the amount of \$372,921,373, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333, for a total amount of \$1,118,764,119, as follows:

- i. the Estate of Joyce Ann Carpeneto in the amount of \$1,926,378, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$5,779,134;
- ii. the Estate of Denease Conley in the amount of \$6,341,635, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$19,024,905;

- iii. the Estate of Wayne T. Davis in the amount of \$9,388,123, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$28,164,369;
- iv. the Estate of Francisco Garfi in the amount of \$22,829,152, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$68,487,456;
- v. the Estate of Timothy Grazioso in the amount of \$307,289,003, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$921,867,009;
- vi. the Estate of LeRoy W. Homer in the amount of \$9,281,150, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$27,843,450;
- vii. the Estate of Leon Lebor in the amount of \$747,568, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$2,242,704;
- viii. the Estate of Rocco Medaglia in the amount of \$5,800,381, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$17,401,143;
- ix. the Estate of Louis J. Nacke in the amount of \$8,185,357, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$24,556,071; and
- x. the Estate of Sandra Wright-Cartledge in the amount of \$1,132,626, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333 for a total of \$3,397,878.

c) The total amount of compensatory pain-and-suffering and economic loss damages awarded in favor of the ten *Grazioso* 9/11 Decedent Estate Plaintiffs, trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333, is \$1,178,764,119:

	<b>Plaintiff Estate of 9/11 Decedent</b>	<b>Personal Representative</b>	<b>Pain &amp; Suffering</b>	<b>Pain &amp; Suffering Trebled</b>	<b>Economic Loss</b>	<b>Economic Loss Trebled</b>	<b>All Compensatory Damages Trebled</b>
1.	Estate of Joyce Ann Carpeneto	Joseph Carpeneto	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$1,926,378	\$5,779,134	\$11,779,134
2.	Estate of Denease Conley	Herman Ray	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$6,341,635	\$19,024,905	\$25,024,905
3.	Estate of Wayne T. Davis	Tanya Davis	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$9,388,123	\$28,164,369	\$34,164,369
4.	Estate of Francisco Garfi	Vito Garfi	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$22,829,152	\$68,487,456	\$74,487,456
5.	Estate of Timothy Grazioso	Deborah Grazioso	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$307,289,003	\$921,867,009	\$927,867,009
6.	Estate of LeRoy W. Homer	Melodie Homer	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$9,281,150	\$27,843,450	\$33,843,450
7.	Estate of Leon Lebor	Barbara Lurman	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$747,568	\$2,242,704	\$8,242,704
8.	Estate of Rocco Medaglia	Elizabeth Medaglia- Cordes	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$5,800,381	\$17,401,143	\$23,401,143
9.	Estate of Louis J. Nacke	Amy Martinez	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$8,185,357	\$24,556,071	\$30,556,071
10.	Estate of Sandra Wright- Cartledge	Dian Dembinski	\$2,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$1,132,626	\$3,397,878	\$9,397,878
	<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>\$20,000,000</b>	<b>\$60,000,000</b>	<b>\$372,921,373</b>	<b>\$1,118,764,119</b>	<b>\$1,178,764,119</b>

and **IT IS FURTHER**

**ORDERED** that compensatory damages are entered in favor of the two-hundred and thirteen (213) *Grazioso* Solatium Plaintiffs and against the Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan aka the Taliban in the amount of \$1,339,125,000 as stated below and as reflected on the submitted

**Exhibit B** accompanying the Motion, which are trebled under the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C.

§2333, to the amount of \$4,017,375,000:

	<b>9/11 Solatium Plaintiff</b>	<b>9/11 Decedent</b>	<b>Relationship</b>	<b>Solatium Award</b>	<b>Compensatory. Damages Trebled</b>
1.	Aaron Adler	Lee Alan Adler	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
2.	Isabell Dansinger Adler	Lee Alan Adler	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
3.	Jay Adler	Lee Alan Adler	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
4.	Arline Peabody-Bane	Michael Bane	Step-Parent	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
5.	Brenda E. Jobe	Michael Bane	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000	\$6,375,000
6.	Brian Major	Michael Bane	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000	\$6,375,000
7.	Joseph Carpeneto	Joyce Ann Carpeneto	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
8.	James Casazza	John F. Casazza	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
9.	Michael Chirchirillo	Peter Chirchirillo	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
10.	Nicholas Chirchirillo	Peter Chirchirillo	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
11.	Leslie Coale Brown, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Joan Ann Coale	Jeffry Coale	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
12.	Daniel D. Coffey, M.D., as Personal Representative of the Estate of Daniel F. Coffey, Jr.	Daniel M. Coffey	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
13.	Daniel D. Coffey, M.D., as Personal Representative of the Estate of Jeanette Coffey	Daniel M. Coffey	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
14.	Colleen McDonald	Jason Coffey	Spouse	\$12,500,000	\$37,500,000
15.	Susan Bohan	Jeffrey Collman	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000	\$6,375,000
16.	Keith Bradkowski	Jeffrey Collman	Spouse	\$12,500,000	\$37,500,000
17.	Kathryn E. Collman	Jeffrey Collman	Step-Parent	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
18.	Charles Edward Gengler	Jeffrey Collman	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000	\$6,375,000
19.	Steven Gengler	Jeffrey Collman	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000	\$6,375,000
20.	Vicki Lynn Michel	Jeffrey Collman	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
21.	Keith Bradkowski, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Beverly Sutton	Jeffrey Collman	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
22.	Carolyn Sutton	Jeffrey Collman	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
23.	Cherrie L. Allen	Denease Conley	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
24.	Irma Joyce Fletcher	Denease Conley	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
25.	Barbara Haynes-Jenkins	Denease Conley	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
26.	Myra Bird, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Earl Ray	Denease Conley	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
27.	Herman Ray	Denease Conley	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
28.	Herman Ray, as Personal Representative of the Estate of James Ray	Denease Conley	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
29.	Odetta Haywood, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Stanley Ray	Denease Conley	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000



30.	Gabrielle Hunter Davis	Wayne T. Davis	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
31.	Malachai Roarke Davis	Wayne T. Davis	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
32.	Tanya Davis	Wayne T. Davis	Spouse	\$12,500,000	\$37,500,000
33.	Noverta Davis-Dean	Wayne T. Davis	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
34.	Anita DeBlase	James V. DeBlase	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
35.	Anthony DeBlase	James V. DeBlase	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
36.	Richard DeBlase	James V. DeBlase	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
37.	Jason Diehl	Michael Diehl	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
38.	Harley DiNardo, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Esterina DiNardo	Maria DiNardo- Schorpp	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
39.	Harley DiNaro	Maria DiNardo- Schorpp	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
40.	Pio DiNardo	Maria DiNardo- Schorpp	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
41.	Andrew Economos	Constantine Economos	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
42.	Andrew Economos and Olga Valinotti, as co- Personal Representatives of the Estate of Leon Economos	Constantine Economos	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
43.	Olga Valinotti	Constantine Economos	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
44.	Corazon Fernandez, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Cirilo Fernandez	Judy Fernandez	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
45.	Richard Fernandez	Judy Fernandez	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
46.	Timothy Regan, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Emma Fernandez Regan	Judy Fernandez	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
47.	Constance Finnicum	Richard Gabrielle	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
48.	George "Gabe" Gabrielle	Richard Gabrielle	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
49.	Renee L. Gamboa	Ronald Gamboa	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
50.	Renee L. Gamboa, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Ranulf Gamboa	Ronald Gamboa	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
51.	Maria Joule	Ronald Gamboa	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
52.	Rachael G. Malubay	Ronald Gamboa	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
53.	Marianna Garfi	Francesco Garfi	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
54.	Salvatore Garfi	Francesco Garfi	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
55.	Vito Garfi	Francesco Garfi	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
56.	John Haller, as Personal Representative of the Estate of James Bond Godshalk	William Godshalk	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
57.	Jane G. Haller	William Godshalk	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
58.	Carolee Azzarello	John Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
59.	Kristy Grazioso, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Hank Grazioso	John Grazioso	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000

60.	Kathryn Grazioso	John Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
61.	Kristen Grazioso	John Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
62.	Kristy Grazioso	John Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
63.	Michael Grazioso	John Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
64.	Carolee Azzarello, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Sandra Grazioso	John Grazioso	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
65.	Karen Ventre	John Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
66.	Carolee Azzarello	Timothy Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
67.	Briana Grazioso	Timothy Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
68.	Deborah Grazioso	Timothy Grazioso	Spouse	\$12,500,000	\$37,500,000
69.	Kristy Grazioso, as Personal Representative of Hank Grazioso	Timothy Grazioso	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
70.	Kristy Grazioso	Timothy Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
71.	Lauren Grazioso	Timothy Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
72.	Carolee Azzarello, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Sandra Grazioso	Timothy Grazioso	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
73.	Karen Ventre	Timothy Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
74.	Douglas Halvorson	James D. Halvorson	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
75.	Kate Halvorson, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Evelyn Halvorson	James D. Halvorson	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
76.	Kate Halvorson	James D. Halvorson	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
77.	Lea Michaela Havlish	Donald G. Havlish	Step-Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
78.	Sean Bitterman	Donald G. Havlish	Step-Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
79.	Derrick Hobin	James Jeffrey Hobin	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
80.	Teresa Cooke	LeRoy W. Homer	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
81.	Christine Homer, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Thomas Freimark	LeRoy W. Homer	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
82.	Michelle Hargis	LeRoy W. Homer	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
83.	Christine Homer	LeRoy W. Homer	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
84.	Ilse Homer	LeRoy W. Homer	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
85.	Laurel Homer	LeRoy W. Homer	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
86.	Melodie Homer	LeRoy W. Homer	Spouse	\$12,500,000	\$37,500,000
87.	Monique Homer	LeRoy W. Homer	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
88.	Marilyn Johnson	LeRoy W. Homer	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
89.	Cheryl Homer-Wilson	LeRoy W. Homer	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
90.	Germaine Wilson	LeRoy W. Homer	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
91.	Kevin Jian	Hweidar Jian	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
92.	William Jian	Hweidar Jian	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
93.	Audrey R. Jones	Donald Jones	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
94.	Candy Jones-Moyer, as Personal Representative of the Estate of John R. Jones	Donald Jones	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
95.	Robert A. Jones	Donald Jones	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
96.	Candy Jones Moyer	Donald Jones	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
97.	Andrew Brian Jordan, Jr.	Andrew Brian Jordan,	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000

		Sr.			
98.	Dina LaFond	Jeanette LaFond-Menichino	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
99.	Paul Lavelle	Denis Lavelle	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
100.	Rina "Joy" Kaufman	Leon Lebor	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
101.	Rina "Joy" Kaufman, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Bessie Lebor	Leon Lebor	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
102.	David Lebor	Leon Lebor	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
103.	Rina "Joy" Kaufman, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Philip Lebor	Leon Lebor	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
104.	Barbara Lurman	Leon Lebor	Child	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
105.	Cathryn Lostrangio	Joesph Lostrangio	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
106.	Diane Lostrangio, as Personal Representative of the Estate of James Lostrangio	Joesph Lostrangio	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
107.	Joseph Lostrangio, Jr.	Joesph Lostrangio	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
108.	Erich Maerz	Noell Maerz	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
109.	Daniel R. Maher	Daniel L. Maher	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
110.	Joseph F. Maher	Daniel L. Maher	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
111.	MaryEllen Megaglia, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Annemarie Medaglia	Rocco Medaglia	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
112.	Diana Medaglia	Rocco Medaglia	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
113.	MaryEllen Medaglia	Rocco Medaglia	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
114.	Michael Medaglia	Rocco Medaglia	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
115.	Elizabeth Medaglia-Cordes	Rocco Medaglia	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
116.	Kathleen Medaglia-Dellapenna	Rocco Medaglia	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
117.	Jesse Melendez	Mary Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
118.	Ramon Melendez, Jr.	Mary Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
119.	Ricky Melendez	Mary Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
120.	Tyler Melendez	Mary Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
121.	Margaret Montanez	Mary Melendez	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
122.	Florence Rosario	Mary Melendez	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
123.	Peter C. Milano	Peter T. Milano	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
124.	Jessica Milano-Starks	Peter T. Milano	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
125.	Maria Lambert	Joseph D. Mistrulli	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
126.	Maria Lambert and Johnny S. Mistrulli, as co-Personal Representatives of the Estate Anne Mistrulli	Joseph D. Mistrulli	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
127.	Joanne Mistrulli, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Frank Mistrulli	Joseph D. Mistrulli	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
128.	Johnny S. Mistrulli	Joseph D. Mistrulli	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
129.	Jason Ruben Moreno	Yvette Nichole Moreno	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
130.	Leiana Moreno	Yvette Nichole Moreno	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000

131.	Noelia Moreno	Yvette Nichole Moreno	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
132.	Mary Ellen Murach, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Edward John Murach	Robert M. Murach	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
133.	Mary Ellen Murach	Robert M. Murach	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
134.	Richard J. Murach	Robert M. Murach	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
135.	Katherine Tynion	Robert M. Murach	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
136.	Amy Martinez	Louis J. Nacke	Spouse	\$12,500,000	\$37,500,000
137.	Dale Allen Nacke	Louis J. Nacke	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
138.	Joseph Nicholas Nacke	Louis J. Nacke	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
139.	Kenneth Nacke	Louis J. Nacke	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
140.	Dale Allen Nacke, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Louis P. Nacke	Louis J. Nacke	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
141.	Louis Paul Nacke II	Louis J. Nacke	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
142.	Paula Nacke-Jacobs	Louis J. Nacke	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
143.	Dale Allen Nacke, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Philomena Millace Nacke	Louis J. Nacke	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
144.	Thomas Papasso	Salvatore T. Papasso	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
145.	Joel R. Perry, as Personal Representative of the Estate of James Leslie Perry	John Perry	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
146.	Amanda Rogers	Marsha Ratchford	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
147.	Claudia Stallworth	Marsha Ratchford	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
148.	Roosevelt Stallworth	Marsha Ratchford	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
149.	Angela Stallworth-Blunt	Marsha Ratchford	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
150.	Adam Reiss	Joshua Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
151.	Gary Reiss	Joshua Reiss	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
152.	Jennifer Reiss	Joshua Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
153.	Johnathan Reiss	Joshua Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
154.	Jordan Reiss	Joshua Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
155.	Diana Diaz	Elvin Romero	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
156.	Diana Diaz, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Carmen Romero	Elvin Romero	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
157.	Diana Diaz, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Isaac Romero	Elvin Romero	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
158.	Audrey Model	Richard Rosenthal	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
159.	Loren Rosenthal, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Evan Rosenthal	Richard Rosenthal	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
160.	Audrey Model, as Personal Representative of the Estate of the Estate of Florence Rosenthal	Richard Rosenthal	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
161.	Audrey Model, as Personal	Richard Rosenthal	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000

	Representative of the Estate of the Estate of Leonard Rosenthal				
162.	Loren Rosenthal, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Seth Rosenthal	Richard Rosenthal	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
163.	Raymond Santillan	Maria Theresa Santillan	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
164.	Victor Santillan	Maria Theresa Santillan	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
165.	Lori Brody	Scott Schertzer	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
166.	Naomi-Ruth Shefi	Hagay Shefi	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
167.	Roy-Yetkutel Shefi	Hagay Shefi	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
168.	Sarah Funk	Paul K. Sloan	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
169.	Matt Sloan	Paul K. Sloan	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
170.	Barbara Hargrove	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
171.	Christine Jackson	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
172.	Raymond Smith, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Deborah Sallad	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
173.	Carl Smith	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
174.	Kevin Smith	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
175.	Korry Smith	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
176.	Letricia Smith	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
177.	Raymond Smith, Jr.	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
178.	Elania Smith-Wylie	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
179.	Raymond Smith, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Marion Thomas	George Smith	Grandparent (Functional Equivalent of a Parent)	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
180.	Tanya Warren	George Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
181.	Michelle Donlan	Timothy Soulas	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
182.	Andrew J. Soulas	Timothy Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
183.	Christopher Soulas	Timothy Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
184.	Daniel Soulas	Timothy Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
185.	Daniel D. Soulas	Timothy Soulas	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
186.	Frederick Soulas	Timothy Soulas	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
187.	Frederick Soulas III	Timothy Soulas	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
188.	Matthew Soulas	Timothy Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
189.	Nicole Soulas	Timothy Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
190.	Stephen Soulas	Timothy Soulas	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
191.	Timothy P. Soulas	Timothy Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
192.	Aaron Straub	Edward W. Straub	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
193.	Edward A. Straub	Edward W. Straub	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
194.	Johnathan Straub	Edward W. Straub	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
195.	Matthew Straub	Edward W. Straub	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
196.	Michael Straub	Edward W. Straub	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
197.	Stanley Straub	Edward W. Straub	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
198.	Jeffrey Tino	Jennifer Tino	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
199.	Salvatore Tino, Jr.	Jennifer Tino	Parent	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
200.	Salvatore Tino III	Jennifer Tino	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
201.	Christopher Barton	Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000

202.	John Barton	Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
203.	Mellanie Chafe	Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
204.	Joseph Nicklo	Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
205.	Lynne Dunn, as Personal Representative of the Estate of John "Jack" Bradish	Sandra Wright-Cartledge	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
206.	Dian Dembinski	Sandra Wright-Cartledge	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
207.	Stephen Bradish	Sandra Wright-Cartledge	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
208.	Melanie D. Buchman, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Loretta Haines	Sandra Wright-Cartledge	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
209.	Patricia Mason	Sandra Wright-Cartledge	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
210.	Geraldine Deborah Spaeder	Sandra Wright-Cartledge	Sibling	\$4,250,000	\$12,750,000
211.	Debra Zeplin	Marc Scott Zeplin	Spouse	\$12,500,000	\$37,500,000
212.	Ethan Zeplin	Marc Scott Zeplin	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
213.	Ryan Zeplin	Marc Scott Zeplin	Child	\$8,500,000	\$25,500,000
			<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$1,339,125,000</b>	<b>\$4,017,375,000</b>

and **IT IS FURTHER**

**ORDERED** that the total award in favor of the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs and against the Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan aka the Taliban is in the amount of **\$5,196,139,119**;

**ORDERED** that the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs are awarded prejudgment interest at the rate of 4.96% per annum, compounded annually, running from September 11, 2001, until the date of partial final judgment; **AND IT IS FURTHER**

**ORDERED** that the *Grazioso* Plaintiffs may submit a further application for punitive damages consistent with a future ruling of the Court on this issue; **AND IT IS FURTHER**

**ORDERED** that this Court expressly finds that there is no just reason for delay in this case, and this is a final appealable order pursuant to Rule 54(b), **AND IT IS FURTHER**

**ORDERED** that the Clerk of Court may terminate the Motions at MDL Doc. No. 10720 and *Grazioso* Doc. No. 90.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_  
New York, New York

\_\_\_\_\_  
GEORGE B. DANIELS  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE